

Panel 7 – New Governmental Strategies That Use Metrics and Link Economic Growth and Human Rights

Jane Sigmon, Senior Coordinator, International Programs, Office to Monitor and Combat Trafficking in Persons, US Department of State

Metrics to Assess Progress in Reducing Trafficking

Human trafficking here includes forced/bonded labor, slavery, etc.

Metrics were laid out in the Trafficking Victims' Protection Act: countries' laws and activities; 140 countries signed protocol since Palermo Protocol... over 120 countries now criminalize all forms of trafficking

Housing and employment schemes for bonded laborers... count number of slaves freed...

More recent project was a radio campaign targeting communities with very high incidences of bonded labor. "Who are you calling helpless?" – self-help programs; did people know what bonded labor was? That it wrong? That they could ask for payment in wages?

Some analysis working with BBC World Trust on the tipping point that prompts change – how do you go from knowledge and attitudes to behavioral change?

Ginny Bauman, Associate Director of Programs, Free the Slaves

Metrics to Assess Progress in Reducing Trafficking

Particular research study for how Free the Slaves is measuring – **Freedom Dividend**

- What impact does bringing people out of slavery have on victims and the wider community?
- Slavery is so common in carpet production, etc. region of northern India that it's almost invisible
- When people think of bonded labor/slavery in India they are blinded to it... it's really only in places where when people come out of slavery and have been out for some time that they can talk about the violence that was taking place

Women start earning an income and use that small economic ability to challenge the slaveholders and demand real wages for their agricultural work.

What is the Freedom Dividend?

- The broad set of changes seen in many locations in a few countries where the organization is working... it comes with approaches to community organizing... you don't just bring people out of slavery

Freedom Dividend

- Increased earnings
- Improved education
- Reductions in violence against women
- Creation of savings and asset information
- Access to health care
- Reductions in corruption

Are they in slavery?

- Do people have a debt, and is it to the same person they work for?
- What would happen if they tried to leave?
- ...

Is there evidence of economic improvement?

- Are they paid real wages?
- What is the level of pay and working hours?
- Has their diet improved and height/weight raised...?
- ...

Is there evidence of social and political improvements?

- Is the health visitor actually coming to the village?
- Are immunizations getting done?
- Are the children in school?
- What is the access to birth control?
- Is women's safety improving?
- What changes are happening in the community's access to social entitlements?

Raymond Gilpin, Associate VP, Sustainable Economies, USIP

Measuring Progress with Reconstruction and Human Rights in Conflict Environments: A Metrics Framework

What indicators could we measure?

- Indicators that are both easy and reliable and are also pertinent to the issues: economic reconstruction *and* human rights.
- How do these relate? Anecdotal evidence between human rights and economic reconstruction... how much do we really know about causality?
- Third question: would this make any difference?
 - Amnesty report: "On Who's Behalf?" → it DOES matter what we measure
 - Quality of life and human rights in the conflict affected environment of Iraq.

Indicators have to be measured so that we could be able to say economic construction is going on one hand and human rights on the other.

It is difficult to identify the economic reconstruction linkage.

Answering the previous what/why/how questions would help us...

Michael Dziedzic, Senior Program Officer, Center for Post-Conflict Peace and Stability Operations, USIP

Measuring Progress with Reconstruction and Human Rights in Conflict Environments

Purpose of MPICE: Measuring Conflict Transformation

- Conflict drivers → motivations and means for violent conflict

Institutional Performance

Organization of MPICE

- MPICE is divided into 5 sectors or end states:
 - Safe and Secure Environment
 -
 -
 -
 -
 -

Organization of MPICE

- Goal
 - A higher-order objective that an intervention is intended to achieve (50)
- Indicator
 - Variable that provides a valid means to determine whether the goal is being met (150)
-

Data Collection Methodologies

- Methodologies are selected b/c they are best suited to collect the data required for a given measure

Safe and Secure Environment

- Drivers of Conflict
-

Safe and Secure Environment

- Institutional Performance
 - Goal
 - Strengthen Accountability to Legitimate Political Authority
 - Indicator
 - Do military and intelligence services respect human rights?
 - Measures
 - Violations of human rights standards are investigated, adjudicated and punished
 - Citizens perceive that the military and intelligence services respect human rights

Rule of Law

- Drivers of Conflict
 - Goal
 - Diminish Justice
 - Indicator
 - Is the legal system used as an instrument of repression?
 - Measures
 - Detainees/prisoners are subject to torture or inhumane treatment (by identity group) (EK)
 - Percentage of citizens who fear law enforcement agencies will abuse them if arrested (S/PD)

Rule of Law

- Institutional Performance
 - Goal
 - Respect for human rights strengthened
 - Indicator
 - Do civilian government authorities respect human rights?
 - Measures
 - Number of political prisoners
 - Percentage of prisons and detention center operating in compliance with...

Political Moderation

- Institutional Performance
 - Goal
 - Strengthen respect for minority rights...
 - ...

No explicit linkage between economic growth and human rights; what they do measure but not as a human right is reinforcing cleavages in society... income, employment, literacy, distribution of jobs and government resources, etc...

Particular interest in the employment of military-age youth

Tom Kelly, Managing Director, Development Policy Division, Millenium Challenge Corporation

How the MCC Uses Metrics

What is MCC?

- The MCC is a US government agency designed to reduce poverty through economic growth in select developing countries
 - Good governance, economic freedom, investments in people → works with poor but well governed countries (the “better” governed poor countries)
 - Looking at indicators to compare relative standards across countries.
 - Working in a much smaller set of countries than USAID
 - Not doing programming for human rights; primarily an agency about promoting economic growth... however, human rights is a very important issue for the US government and thus the MCC and particularly for the Obama administration

MCC’s mandate: Reduce poverty through economic growth

- Created with bipartisan support by US Congress in 2004
- Led by a governing Board of Directors
 - Secretary of State (chair)
 - (private sector included)

Two types of poverty reduction programs

- MCC Compacts
 - About 19 countries
 - 5-year investment agreements to try to help country's economy grow faster
 - Complex; help with infrastructure and some governance programs, etc.
- Threshold Programs
 - Countries don't score quite as well on indicators so they are smaller amounts of money

What's different about MCC?

- Competitive selection
- Country-led design
- Country-led implementation
- Focus on results

Competitive Selection

- MCC's Board selects countries based on their policy performance
- The potential reward of a Compact creates a powerful incentive for good policies.
- Good policies are closely related to growth and poverty reduction:
 - Aid is more effective in countries which invest in their people, where governments are accountable, where the poor can participate in the economy.

Indicators: 3 categories

- Ruling justly
 - Civil liberties
 - Political rights
- Investing in people
- Economic freedom
- ...Sources
 - Freedom House
 - World Bank Institute
 - UNESCO
 - Center for International Earth Science
 - IMF
 - WHO
 - Heritage Foundation
 - International Fund for Agricultural Development
 - **NOT** from the US government
- If scores on certain rights issues are too low, the board will not work with them.
- 23 countries the MCC can work with using the indicators

Maintaining Eligibility

- Leverage
- Assessing performance over time

Q&A

Michael Moore: Are there some human rights violations that will kick you out of the program from the start (MCC)?

- Tom Kelly: If you score above the median, you do relatively well and pass. If a country scores below the median, that's not what we're looking for.

Noora, World Bank: Curious about work in India... used to work on forced labor in Pakistan... measuring data in places where something illegal is happening?

- Jane: Prevalence is extremely difficult to measure because of the nature of the crime. There are some incident measures/approaches that we've used related to different types of sampling methodology. The only figures are the ILO's global figures with regard to forced labor.
- Ginny: I agree, it is difficult to measure prevalence because it's hidden. In some villages it's possible to go and talk to the populations but in some instances you can't do that. If you can't say the problem is significant and/or that you're reducing it, then it's hard to get money into it. After a few villages, the survey gets expensive. What makes it difficult for slavery to prosper? → how much resistance there is the community, what people know about their rights and reporting to the police, etc.... Is deterrence real, how to get those laws enforced, what laws exist... If you can put those things together then you can see if you are making progress in the right direction.

Rod, UCL: If you don't have a sense of the idea of the Freedom Dividend, no sense of how large the problem is, you don't have a sense of how large the dividend is... there is one, but how to approach it in a more meaningful way given the data you have...

- Ginny: Things like "when did you last see a doctor, etc." This is very much a pilot process but we all need to understand what happens when you bring people out of slavery in effective ways.

Q: For Tom, when you're evaluating the program, do you only use some particular measurement tools...? When you are using this system...? Why aren't you working with Ukraine?

- Tom: For the third question, Ukraine is now too rich for the MCC to work with.
- There is some evaluation of the process but trying to shift attention to looking at impact. It's different than for many bilateral assistance donors because the US has more than one agency... MCC is specifically *not* to go to more corrupt places... statutory mandate. Yet, their foreign assistance dollars are likely to have a greater impact in better-governed countries.

Susan Aaronson, GWU: Issues of trust in the government... don't you want to create citizens that are monitoring the government? That seems to be missing in the government. Building on Rod's point of what I'll call duplicity that you are repeating... both groupings are using the most popular metrics but perhaps not the best for determining what you're looking at. Hard to find good metrics to measure the rule of law and the judiciary... how do people become judges? What you are calling rule of law... is really about supply side of governance while ignoring demand? Do people believe in their government...

- Tom: Scorecards published on the MCC website; try to make much of them... but extent to which they get to important political actors is a given country depends... the scorecard becomes a big part of political discourse in some countries... Use independent, third party measurements for rule of law...

...

- Ray Gilpin: Important to recognize what more traditional indices can and cannot do...

Bob Hershey, consultant: Tom Kelly, how much of your process of working with countries and making decisions are you able to get up on the internet?

- Tom Kelly: Selection of countries, scorecards are online and downloadable, as is methodology... it is transparent to that extent. In terms of investment programs that country has... dialogue between economists at MCC and other countries is not blow-by-blow but it's communicated and to Congress... there is an enormous amount of info if you look

Tony: Question about Freedom Dividend; a lot of the indicators in that would be directly affected by interventions, income generation... how does one distinguish between what's attributable to reduction in slavery and what to specific interventions or if you're not concerned about either?

- Amanda (from the audience??): I think it's not distinguishable...
- Ginny: When you help people to realize what slavery is and what it's doing to them then answers to these questions lead to women experiencing less domestic violence, more political participation, etc.