

### **Professor Susan Aaronson: What do you think? (Final discussion)**

Q: Is anyone working on confidence intervals for different metrics? How do we determine how accurate we think the metrics are right now?

- Kendall: Corporations... where data is uncertain for the impact with corporations, we include an uncertainty factor; usually companies can acquire the data for us
- Rod: Not necessarily to have confidence intervals around metrics you're using... otherwise probably just guestimating how good or bad data is...

Q: Why are there not more human rights organizations represented here? Is the human rights community not interested?

- Susan Aaronson: HRW is trying to come up with some metrics.
- ...invited, but many did not attend/respond or canceled...

Q: Concern about business and human rights; worked in local investment bank in Ukraine; human rights were there but lot of poverty and no respect for pregnant women; with multinationals, they respect human rights, local companies in emerging markets, what can make them act?

- Ian Higham: We did invite a lot of NGOs.
- 
- Ian Higham: Smaller/national-only business enterprises don't have human rights policies.

- David Cingranelli: I've reached out to many human rights NGOs and many are not responsive.
- 
- Kendall: Human rights NGOs feel that the world of academia doesn't pertain to them anymore.
- 
- Susan Aaronson: I don't agree with that. They are member driven, like Amnesty and Freedom House, not staff-driven... whereas Oxfam is staff-driven and more national-based. Those organizations are able to tell their board what to focus on.
- 
- Q: From HR org present; some orgs are coming around to learn how to institutionalize these measures... anecdotally I think things are changing.
- 
- Susan: James, what's your response... NGOs have responded positively to multidimensional poverty measurements right?
- 
- James Foster: Yes, they have been responsive...
- 
- Garth: Freedom Dividend might be a nice "acorn" in which to talk about multidimensional deprivational analysis... take the framework by the six bullets and make a little freedom dividend deprivation model...
- 
- Rod: The metrics are useful... be careful how we go about it... you can't draw conclusions about freeing people from slavery without the right research design even if you do have the right metrics.
- 
- Ginny: The first thing we said was that we need to ask what the control group is.
- 
- Jane: Shock and horror when I mentioned control group at meeting... controversy over randomized control studies, but we have to do it despite resistance...
- 
- Comment: there are ethical concerns with metrics....
- 
- Jane: when dealing with people, always ethical concerns
- 
- Rob: Broader benefit; obviously normative thing... Kevin Bales did some work that links a lack of slavery to economic growth etc... may not need a troublesome controlled experiment
- 
- Rod: Scorecard just says what is your situation now but are they path-dependent issues which if they weren't there would they be doing better... are

we unfairly saying they're scoring too low on the metrics so we're not going to help them?

- 
- Tom: It's an extraordinary challenge for us to get at issues like that, the long-term drivers of growth... using the scorecard as a diagnostic tool is a clunky production function... We are trying to ground the dialogue we have with our board in talking about policy issues. The scorecard's limitation is also its power: so simple and comprehensible. It is useful that it is simple.

Susan Aaronson: What do you think would be useful as a next step? Book? Follow-up conference?

- Comment: Make all research papers and presentations available
- Susan: All will be available on IIEP website along with film of the conference.
- 
- Comment: I'm from a small NGO and the gap with NGOs not coming... I think the next step is to engage with activist folks; don't make it so metrics-heavy. Make it more accessible and appealing to an NGO.
- Susan: You mean less scholarly stuff?
  - Yeah maybe less scholarly stuff.
- 
- Comment: Bring in coalitions to see what they're doing creating impact and measuring impact that's important to them.
- Susan: So you want to see a conference on multi-sectoral initiatives on human rights?
  - (that is what she wants, with coalitions)
- 
- Comment: We should have a workshop to play with all these new metrics tools.
- Susan: Training in using the metrics?
  - Comment: Yeah so people can learn them and investigate
- 
- Comment: Show what NGOs can do and how they can do this; case studies such as Free the Slaves about how much they have relied on this kind of effort
- 
- Jane: There is a tremendous interest in metrics... everyone wants to show what they are doing so they can attract money, prove their results, etc. Many NGOs have the capacity but many don't; find ways to promote partnerships to help NGOs do this.
- 
- Kendall: The business panel was markedly low on metrics... and some people said there aren't metrics for business; some said maybe business doesn't need metrics... there needs to be discussion there. There *are* metrics

for business, maybe they are good and maybe not, we should follow up on that.

- 
- Jane: We do work with some metrics that apply to business such as measuring slavery in supply chains...